

MICCAI 2020 Area Chairs - Rebuttal viewing and Final Recommendation

Dear Area Chairs:

The next phase of the review process is to select final acceptances from those papers for which rebuttals were requested. Each paper requiring rebuttal is assigned an additional two secondary Area Chairs who will rate each rebutted paper as either accept or reject based on the rebuttal.

The rebuttal is submitted as “Author feedback” in CMT. Please refer to the instructions below and screenshots on page 2 on how to view the rebuttals and additional information. Please complete Question 12 (brief comment) and 13 (accept/Reject) for each rebuttal paper (including the papers you were assigned as primary AC). We need to accept around 40% of the rebuttal papers, so if each of you approves ~10 papers from your pool, we will be close to the desired result and have room to maneuver. Program Chairs will be responsible for adjusting the final result.

The final recommendation is due on June 9th.

Instructions and Useful CMT Tips:

1. Together with those papers originally assigned to you, you will see more than the original ~23 papers assigned to you once logged into the CMT system. Use the filter function in the “Chair Note/Status” column to filter papers based on their status. Type “Invite for Rebuttal” to select papers invited for rebuttal. (Item 1 in screenshot)
2. In the “My Tag” column, you are tagged as the primary AC for papers that were originally assigned to you. If there is no tag, then this paper is assigned to you after the rebuttal phase for which you are now serving as the secondary AC. (Item 2 in screenshot)
3. Click the “**View Author Feedback**” link in the “Discussion & Feedback” column to view the rebuttal. The meta-review from the primary AC is also visible to you. Click “**all meta-review**” to view. (Item 3)
4. Make your recommendation after reading the original submission, the reviews, the rebuttal, and the meta-review from the primary AC.
5. Enter your final decision via “**Edit Meta-review**” link (item 4) if you are the primary AC of this paper. Use “**Enter Meta-review**” (item 5) if you are the secondary AC. Please note that you will not be able to modify the answers for the first 11 questions in the meta-review form. **Scroll down to the bottom and submit your response for questions 12 and 13.** Make sure you save your meta-review when you are done.
6. Rate your reviewers. If you are the primary AC of a paper, please rate your reviewers if you have not yet done so. This is optional if you are the secondary AC.

Paper ID ↑	Title	Chair Note Status	Subject Areas		Review				Meta-Reviewers	My Tags	Meta-Review	Discussion & Feedback	Review Rating	
			Primary	Secondary	Reviewers	Assigned	Completed	% Completed					Completed	% Completed
[Redacted]	[Redacted]	1	• Image-Guided Interventions and Surgery	• Applications of Big Data in Imaging ; • Interventional Imaging Systems	[Redacted]	4	3 View Reviews	75%	Meta-Reviewer MetaReviewer #2 MetaReviewer #3 MetaReviewer #1	Primary Meta-Reviewer 2	ID: Meta-Reviewer #1 Edit Meta-Review View Meta-Review 4	All Meta-Reviews View Author Feedback Status: Invite for Rebuttal 3	3	100%
[Redacted]	[Redacted]		• Surgical and Interventional Simulation Systems	• Registration and Fusion	[Redacted]	3	3 View Reviews	100%	Meta-Reviewer MetaReviewer #3	Primary Meta-Reviewer	ID: Meta-Reviewer #3 Edit Meta-Review View Meta-Review Rejected paper, no action is required.	All Meta-Reviews Status: Provisional Reject	3	100%
[Redacted]	[Redacted]		• Image Reconstruction and Image Quality	• Image-Guided Interventions and Surgery	[Redacted]	3	3 View Reviews	100%	Meta-Reviewer MetaReviewer #1 MetaReviewer #3 MetaReviewer #2		ID: Meta-Reviewer #3 Enter Meta-Review 5	All Meta-Reviews Status: Invite for Rebuttal	0	0%
[Redacted]	[Redacted]		• Image-Guided Interventions and Surgery	• Interventional Imaging Systems ; • Surgical Visualization and Mixed, Augmented and Virtual Reality	[Redacted]	3	3 View Reviews	100%	Meta-Reviewer MetaReviewer #2	Primary Meta-Reviewer	ID: Meta-Reviewer #2 Edit Meta-Review View Meta-Review accepted paper, no action is required.	All Meta-Reviews Status: Provisional Accept	3	100%